

Internships: The College and University Perspective

Patricia A. Smith, Esq.
smithpa@ballardspahr.com
856.873.5521

Louis L. Chodoff, Esq.
chodoffl@ballardspahr.com
856.761.3436

Introduction

- Unpaid internships are a time honored tradition in the workplace and in college, providing students with experience in the work force and, frequently, a stepping stone to a paying job after graduation.
- According to a survey conducted by the National Association of Colleges and Employers, 47.9 percent of internships taken by the Class of 2013 were unpaid.
- The legal landscape recently has changed. Unpaid internships are increasingly leading to lawsuits with interns claiming that they are really employees who should have been paid at least the Fair Labor Standards Act ("FLSA") minimum wage and/or overtime wages.

What is an Internship?

- Internships are generally arrangements in which college students, recent graduates and/or career changers lend their talents to companies in return for an opportunity to develop business skills, learn about a new industry, gain experience and contacts in the work environment.
- Internships may be paid or unpaid. The focus of our presentation is on unpaid internships in the for-profit sector.

National Association of Colleges and Employers' Definition of Internship

NACE recommends the following definition of an “internship” to ensure that colleges, students, and employers consistently define “internships”:

“An internship is a form of experiential learning that integrates knowledge and theory learned in the classroom with practical application and skills development in a professional setting. Internships give students the opportunity to gain valuable applied experience and make connections in professional fields they are considering for career paths; and give employers the opportunity to guide and evaluate talent.”

Mutual Benefits of an Internship

- Internships are beneficial to the student-intern because he or she receives "real world" business experience and an early opportunity to impress potential employers before graduating from school.
- Employers benefit from internship programs by obtaining the services of skilled personnel for modest cost and by being exposed to new ideas, perspectives and a talent pool. Moreover, employers are given an opportunity to evaluate talent.

The FLSA Requires Employees be Paid for their Work

- The FLSA requires that each non-exempt employee who is engaged in commerce or in the production of goods for commerce, or is employed in an enterprise engaged in such commerce or production, be paid at least the minimum wage for every hour worked. See 29 U.S.C. §206.
- Several individual States however, maintain minimum wage requirements in excess of the federal minimum wage. In these States, employees must be paid the State minimum wage.

Employees Cannot Waive Their FLSA Rights

- In Brooklyn Savings Bank v. O'Neil, 324 U.S. 697 (1945), the United States Supreme Court held that a worker may not waive his or her FLSA rights.
 - Therefore, even when an individual worker is willing to waive the right to compensation, courts will not recognize such a waiver, because of the potential harm to the public at large and because it is difficult to determine whether an individual's waiver actually is voluntary.

Is there an Employer – Employee Relationship

The Employer Employee Relationship

- In order for the FLSA to apply, there must be an employment relationship between an "employer" and an "employee."
 - The FLSA defines the term "employ" very broadly: to "suffer or permit to work."
 - Covered, non-exempt individuals who are "suffered or permitted" to work must be compensated under the law for the services they perform for an employer. See 29 U.S.C. §203.
 - Internships in the "for-profit" private sector will most often be viewed as employment, unless the test for "trainees" is met. Interns who qualify as employees rather than trainees must be paid at least the minimum wage and overtime compensation for hours worked over forty in a workweek.

The Employer Employee Relationship (Continued)

- In Walling v. Portland Terminal Co., 330 U.S. 148, 152 (1947), the U.S. Supreme Court held that, “individuals working for another for their own benefit without expectation of compensation may not be employees Otherwise, all students would be employees of the school or college they attended, and as such entitled to receive minimum wages.”
- Walling made clear that the FLSA does NOT cover an individual who solely for his personal purposes or pleasures, worked in activities carried on by other persons either for pleasure or profit.

The Unpaid Intern Exception to the FLSA

The Unpaid Intern

I've employed interns my whole career, gotten lots of "immediate advantage" out of them. They've done most of the research for my books and most of the research that won me Emmy Awards for consumer reporting. I asked my TV bosses to pay for the research to help, but they laughed at me, saying, "You think we are made of money?" From then on, I got much of my help from unpaid college students.

. . . Am I evil? Am I going to jail?

– John Stossel

The Unpaid Intern (Continued)

- In April 2010, the DOL published Fact Sheet #71 which provides guidance for employers who operate internship programs under the FLSA.

The Unpaid Intern (Continued)

- The Fact Sheet # 71: The Six Factor Test for unpaid Interns:
 - the internship, even though it includes actual operation of the facilities of the employer, is similar to training which would be given in an educational environment;
 - the internship experience is for the benefit of the intern;
 - the intern does not displace regular employees, but works under close supervision of existing staff;
 - the employer that provides the training derives no immediate advantage from the activities of the intern; on occasion, its operations may actually be impeded;
 - the intern is not necessarily entitled to a job at the conclusion of the internship; and
 - the employer and the intern understand that the intern is not entitled to wages for the time spent in the internship.
- According to the DOL, if all of the factors listed above are met, an employment relationship **does not exist** under the FLSA, and the Act's minimum wage and overtime provisions do not apply to the for profit employer. See Fact Sheet #71: Internship Programs Under The Fair Labor Standards Act; see also 5 C.F.R. § 551.104 (applying the same factors above to "trainees"). As discussed below, several Federal Appellate Courts employ a different analysis.

The Unpaid Intern (Continued)

- Fact Sheet # 71 was instrumental in the DOL redoubling its efforts to crack down on employers that fail to pay interns properly.
 - In conjunction with the DOL's increased efforts, Nancy J. Leppink, then Acting Director of the DOL's Wage and Hour Division, said: "If you're a for-profit employer or you want to pursue an internship with a for-profit employer, there aren't going to be many circumstances where you can have an internship and not be paid and still be in compliance with the law." Steven Greenhouse, *The Unpaid Intern, Legal Or Not*, The New York Times (Apr. 2, 2010).

The Unpaid Intern (Continued)

- Similar to an Education Environment
- For the unpaid intern exception to apply, the purpose of the internship must not be to perform productive work.
 - The more an internship program is structured around a classroom or academic experience, as opposed to the employer's actual operations, the more likely the internship will be viewed as an extension of the individual's educational experience.
 - The more the internship provides the individual with skills that can be used in multiple employment settings, as opposed to skills particular to one employer's operation, the more likely the intern would be viewed as receiving training.
 - Under these circumstances the intern does not perform the routine work of the business on a regular and recurring basis, and the business is not dependent upon the work of the intern.

The Unpaid Intern (Continued)

- Displacement And Supervision Issues
 - If an employer uses interns as substitutes for regular workers or to augment its existing workforce, these interns will be viewed as employees and should be paid at least the minimum wage and overtime compensation for hours worked over forty in a workweek.
 - If the employer would have hired additional employees or required existing staff to work additional hours had the interns not performed the work, then they will be viewed as employees and entitled compensation under the FLSA.
 - Conversely, if the employer is providing job shadowing opportunities that allow an intern to learn certain functions under the close and constant supervision of regular employees, but the intern performs minimal or no work, the activity is more likely to be viewed as a bona fide education experience.
 - On the other hand, if the intern receives the same level of supervision as the employer's regular workforce, this would suggest an employment relationship, rather than training. See Fact Sheet #71: Internship Programs Under The Fair Labor Standards Act.

The Unpaid Intern (Continued)

- Job Entitlement
 - The internship should be of a fixed duration, established prior to the outset of the internship.
 - Further, unpaid internships generally should not be used by the employer as a trial period for individuals seeking employment at the conclusion of the internship period.
 - If an intern is placed with the employer for a trial period with the expectation that he or she will then be hired on a permanent basis, that individual generally would be deemed an employee under the FLSA. Id.

Unpaid Interns and the Differing Approaches of the Appellate Courts

The Differing Views of the Federal Appellate Courts

- Appellate courts interpreting the FLSA have not consistently followed the DOL six-factor test for determining an intern's status.
 - Some courts have explicitly criticized the test. Others apply an "economic realities" test or look at the primary beneficiary of the work performed.

The Differing Views of the Federal Appellate Courts (continued)

- The Tenth Circuit applied a totality of the circumstances test considering the DOL's six criteria, but finding that all six criteria are not required for trainees to be excluded from the FLSA. See Reich v. Parker Fire Prot. Dist., 992 F.2d 1023 (10th Cir. 1993).
- The Fourth and Sixth Circuits applied a "primary beneficiaries" test, which means that the individual's status as a trainee depends on whether the employer or the individual is the primary beneficiary of the work performed. See, Solis v. Laurelbrook Sanitarium and Sch., Inc., 642 F.3d 518, 529 (6th Cir. 2011); see also McLaughlin v. Ensley, 877 F.2d 1207 (4th Cir. 1989).

The Federal Appellate Courts Interpretation of the FLSA (continued)

- The Fifth Circuit cited the DOL's six factor test with approval and held that it is entitled to substantial deference. See Atkins v. General Motors Corp., 701 F.2d 1124 (5th Cir. 1983); see also Donovan v. Am. Airlines, Inc., 686 F.2d 267 (5th Cir. 1982).

Not for Profit/Government Agency Unpaid Interns

Not for Profit/Government Agency Unpaid Interns

- Under the FLSA unpaid internships are generally allowable for individuals who **volunteer** their time to nonprofit organizations for religious, charitable, civic, or humanitarian purposes, provided they do so freely and without expecting any compensation.
- There are limits, however. For example, individuals who work in a commercial operation (such as a clothing store or a farm) operated by a non-profit organization are likely to be deemed employees and therefore subject to the FLSA. See *Alamo Found'n v. Secy. Of Labor*, 471 U.S. 290 (1985).

Not for Profit/Government Agency Unpaid Interns (Continued)

- Relevant factors may also include whether the volunteer intern works full-time and whether the volunteer intern displaces any employees.
- In a 2006 opinion letter the United States Department of Labor (“USDOL”) stated: “Typically, such volunteers serve on a part-time basis and do not displace paid workers or perform work that would otherwise be performed by employees.” See Opinion Letter FLSA2006-4, January 27, 2006.

Litigation by Unpaid Interns Under the FLSA

Fox Searchlight Class Action

BLACK SWAN

- On September 28, 2011, Eric Glatt and Alexander Footman, two unpaid interns who had worked on production of the film Black Swan filed a class action complaint in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York against Fox Searchlight, the specialty and independent film division of Twentieth Century Fox Film Corporation.
 - While working on the set of Black Swan, the pair had performed basic chores such as manning phones, fetching coffee, and taking out the trash.
 - The complaint alleges that Fox Searchlight violated federal and state labor laws by failing to pay wages to interns who perform the work of production assistants, bookkeepers, secretaries and janitors on films produced and co-produced by Fox Searchlight.

Fox Searchlight Class Action

BLACK SWAN (Continued)

- On June 11, 2013, U.S. District Court Judge William H. Pauley III, of the Southern District of New York ruled Fox Searchlight Pictures Inc. and Fox Entertainment Group, Inc. ("FEG") liable for failing to pay interns in violation of federal and state labor laws.
 - In the first ruling of its kind, the judge concluded that named plaintiffs were employees of Defendant Fox Searchlight Pictures protected by federal and state wage and hour law.
 - According to the judge: "Searchlight received the benefits of their unpaid work, which otherwise would have required paid employees."

Fox Searchlight Class Action

BLACK SWAN (Continued)

- In reaching its decision, the court examined:
 - Was the training similar to an educational environment.
 - Was the internship experience for the benefit of the intern.
 - Did the interns displace regular employees.
 - Did Searchlight obtain an immediate advantage from plaintiffs' work.
 - Were the plaintiffs entitled to a job at the end of the internship.
 - Did Searchlight and the plaintiffs understand that they were not entitled to wages.

Charlie Rose Class Action

- On March 14, 2012 Lucy Bickerton, a former intern on a PBS talk show, filed a class action complaint in New York against Charles Rose and Charles Rose, Inc.
 - Bickerton alleged that she regularly worked at least 25 hours per week without pay while interning in 2007.
 - Bickerton alleged that her responsibilities included performing daily background research from print and online sources to prepare Mr. Rose for guest interviews, assembling press packets, escorting guests through the studio, breaking down the set after filming, and cleaning up the green room.
- On June 28, 2013, days after the Black Swan case was decided, Rose settled this matter for approximately \$110,000.00, agreeing to pay each eligible intern \$110.00 for each week worked up to a maximum of 10 weeks – the average length of an academic semester internship.

NBC Universal Class Action

- On July 3, 2013, a class action complaint was filed in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York against NBC Universal. The named plaintiffs are two former NBC Universal interns who had provided services for Saturday Night Live and MSNBC cable news.
- The complaint seeks at least \$5 million and alleges that NBC Universal violated federal and state labor laws by failing to pay proper wages to interns who performed productive work on its television programs and in other parts of its multi-media enterprise.
 - Plaintiffs allege that they are owed the applicable minimum wage rate for all hours worked.
 - Plaintiffs are seeking to have the lawsuit certified as a class action to recover unpaid wages, liquidated damages, interest and attorneys' fees for interns who worked for NBC Universal between July 3, 2007 and the date of final judgment.

Wang v. Harper's Bazaar Class Action

- On February 1, 2012, former Harper's Bazaar intern, Xeudan Wang filed a class action lawsuit in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York against the Hearst Corporation.
 - The Complaint alleges that Hearst pays its interns no compensation for the work they perform, including minimum or overtime wages, in violation of federal and state labor laws.
 - On May 7, 2013, the Court denied plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment with respect to their "employee" status under the FLSA and the New York labor law.
 - On June 27, 2013, the Court granted plaintiffs' motion to appeal the decision.

Solis v. Laurelbrook Sanitarium and School, Inc.

- Solis involved an investigation by the Wage and Hour Division of the Department of Labor regarding potential child labor violations committed by the Laurelbrook Sanitarium and School, Inc.
 - Laurelbrook is a non-profit corporation that runs a boarding school for grades 9 through 12 and an elementary school. Laurelbrook follows the teachings of the Seventh-Day Adventist Church and is accredited by the Tennessee Department of Education. The school provides integrated classroom and vocational education. All teachers teach in both settings. The school also operates a Sanitarium, where students are assigned kitchen and housekeeping duties; CNA students may be assigned to provide medical assistance to patients at the Sanitarium.
 - The Court held the students were not “employees” under the FLSA because they do not displace compensated workers; instructors spend extra time supervising students instead of performing productive work; and the students receive tangible and intangible benefits.

Kozik v. Hamilton College

- On December 20, 2012, Benjamin Kozik, a former assistant football coach, filed a class action lawsuit in the United States District Court for the Northern District of New York against Hamilton College.
 - The Complaint alleges that the case concerns “a college with a \$650-750 million endowment that fails to pay Interns in its Athletics Department . . . the wages to which they are entitled to by law.”
 - Specifically, the Complaint alleges that the interns worked for a flat monthly or annual sum, regardless of the hours worked, which resulted in an hourly rate below the minimum wage.
 - The Complaint further alleges that the interns worked more than 40 hours per week, but were not paid overtime compensation.
 - The interns were classified as part-time by Hamilton College.
 - The interns were not students at Hamilton College.
 - Plaintiff’s Motion for Conditional Class Certification is pending.

Practical Concerns –Protecting
Against Potential Exposure to
Litigation by Unpaid Interns
Under the FLSA

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns

- To reduce the potential for a lawsuit, the focus of a compliant internship program should be on providing interns with learning opportunities that build transferable skills that are aligned with specific learning objectives and can be used in multiple employment settings.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Employers who use unpaid interns must consider:
 - how similar the internship is to an educational environment, as opposed to the employer's actual operations.
 - The more educational, academic, or classroom-like the internship experience is, the less likely the intern will be considered an employee.
 - Note however, merely offering school credit to unpaid interns as a benefit to the intern does not eliminate the employer's obligation under the FLSA. School credit alone likely will not satisfy the USDOL test, because all six factors must be considered.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Be confident that the internship experience is for the benefit of the intern – not the employer.
 - If the intern's services include tasks such as filing, performing other clerical work, or assisting customers, it is likely that the employer is benefiting from the internship experience, creating employee status under the FLSA.
 - Conversely, if the intern is not engaged in performing tasks and observes employees performing their duties, or shadows an employee during their work day, the internship will likely be viewed as a benefit to the intern.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Do not allow the intern to displace regular employees.
 - If the employer would have hired additional employees or required existing staff to work additional hours had the interns not performed the work, then the interns will be viewed as employees and entitled compensation under the FLSA.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- The employer must not derive any immediate advantage from the activities of the intern; on occasion, its operations may actually be impeded.
 - This is often the most difficult factor for employers to meet, because many of the tasks that interns are asked to perform will, by their very nature, provide immediate advantages to the employer.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Do not create an internship that promises, or creates an expectation of, a job to the intern at the end of the internship.
 - If so, it is more likely that the intern will be considered an employee under the FLSA.
 - This factor can become more problematic for employers that wish to use internship programs as a "proving ground" for new workers just finishing school or entering the workforce.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Get It in Writing.
 - All employers should require interns to sign a written agreement that clearly spells out the purpose of the internship and the business's expectations for the intern.
 - The agreement should also make clear that interns do not have any expectation of employment at the end of the internship and are not entitled to wages for their time spent as an intern.
 - Because an individual cannot waive their FLSA rights, an employer should not depend solely on any waiver by the intern of the statutory entitlement to wages for his or her services.
 - Regardless of any agreement, the intern may still be considered an employee under the FLSA and entitled to wages.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Create Program Materials for the Interns.
 - While a compliant internship program need not mimic the curricula developed in college-level courses, there should be some academic or educational component incorporated in all internships.
 - This would normally include:
 - written materials that cover specific learning objectives
 - shadowing experiences
 - experiential learning opportunities and traditional classroom learning.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- Assign a Mentor to Each Intern.
 - An appropriate mentor can be a valuable resource, providing a wealth of knowledge to an intern.
 - Having a mentor supervise the work of an intern lessens the likelihood that the person will be perceived as having a level of autonomy that would threaten their status as an intern.

Reducing the Risk of Litigation by Unpaid Interns (continued)

- **Select Interns Based on Scholastic Achievement.**
 - Interns should be selected based on their scholastic achievement and demonstrated willingness to learn.
 - Employers that use an intern selection process that is substantially similar to the hiring process for new employees may threaten intern status.

Best Practices for Colleges and Universities

Background

- Among internships taken by the Class of 2013, 52.2 percent were paid and 47.8 percent were unpaid.
- More than half of these internships were performed at for-profit, private sector organizations.

Internships for Credit

- Internships are a valuable part of a student's education because they enable the student to learn an occupation in the field, apply knowledge learned in the classroom, and form personal connections within an industry.
- Academic credit alone does not transform an improper, unpaid internship into a properly classified unpaid internship under the FLSA, but it is an important factor.
 - In Solis v. Laurelbrook Sanitarium and School, Inc., 642 F.3d 318 (6th Cir. 2011), the Sixth Circuit stated that “concluding that students are not employees simply because they are students at a vocational school is precisely the type of labeling courts must resist.”

Internships for Credit (continued)

- Recommendations for creating and evaluating college internship programs:
 - Establish learning objectives for students completing internships;
 - Establish relationships with companies to ensure compliance with the FLSA;
 - Conduct evaluations of worksites, where possible;
 - Require students to periodically submit papers and presentations to obtain academic credit.

Internships for Credit (continued)

- Colleges should also educate students and employers regarding the FLSA. NACE recommends the following criteria for evaluating internships:
 - Experience must be an extension of the classroom;
 - Skills or knowledge must be transferable to other employment settings;
 - Set beginning and end to the internship;
 - Clearly defined objectives and goals related to the student's academic coursework and professional goals;
 - Supervision by a professional with expertise and educational and/or professional background in the field;
 - Routine feedback by a supervisor;
 - There are resources, equipment, and facilities to support learning objectives/goals.

Internships for Credit (continued)

- Colleges and universities should also monitor positions posted through career centers to ensure that they meet the FLSA standards for unpaid internships.
 - If an internship clearly does not meet the standard, the college/university should remove the posting.

Student-Teachers

- Colleges should review student-teacher programs to ensure:
 - The student-teachers are periodically evaluated for their performance;
 - The student-teachers are not replacing teachers at the school in which they are teaching;
 - The teacher whose classroom in which the student-teacher is teaching is present throughout the day and provides valuable feedback to the student-teacher.

Fellowships

- If a college wishes to pay a research fellow by a stipend, as opposed to an hourly wage, colleges must evaluate the tasks and duties of the position to ensure that there are no FLSA violations.
 - Do the fellows receive tangible benefits?
 - Is there an expectation of future employment?
 - Do the fellows replace other workers?
 - Are the fellows adequately supervised?
- If the fellowship is a training/learning experience, an employer may classify the research fellow as a trainee/intern under the FLSA. If not, the individual must be paid in accordance with the FLSA.

Questions?

Patricia A. Smith, Esq.
Louis L. Chodoff, Esq.

Patricia A. Smith, Esq.
smithpa@ballardspahr.com
856.873.5521

Louis L. Chodoff, Esq.
chodoffl@ballardspahr.com
856.761.3436